

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY**

**IN RE: ELMIRON (PENTOSAN  
POLYSULFATE SODIUM)  
PRODUCTS LIABILITY  
LITIGATION**

**Case No. 2:20-md-02973 (BRM)(ESK)**

**MDL No. 2973**

**JUDGE BRIAN R. MARTINOTTI  
JUDGE EDWARD S. KIEL**

**THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:  
ALL ACTIONS**

**CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER NO. 3**

This matter having been before the Court for an initial case management conference on January 8, 2021, the Court having entered Case Management Order (“CMO”) #1 requiring plaintiffs’ counsel to meet and confer regarding the appointment of a plaintiff leadership committee, counsel having submitted a motion with consensus recommendations to the Court on January 13, 2021 (ECF No. 7),<sup>1</sup> the Court having reviewed the submission and attached submissions by counsel, no objections having been filed, finding that the consensus recommendations present an array of highly skilled counsel with diverse backgrounds and experience which will provide the Court with an effective committee to advance this litigation in an efficient and just manner and will advance the Court’s and the JPML’s goal of introducing new and different counsel to this specialty area of practice, and for good cause shown, the Court hereby appoints the following members to Plaintiffs’ Steering Committee (“PSC”):

---

<sup>1</sup> Pursuant to Case Management Order No. 2, Sec. III(A), any objection to this application should have been filed by January 20, 2021.

1. ***Plaintiffs’ Co-Lead Counsel.*** Virginia E. Anello of Douglas & London, P.C., Parvin Aminolroaya of Seeger Weiss LLP and Paul Pennock of Morgan & Morgan, P.A. shall serve as Co-Lead Counsel of the PSC.

2. ***Plaintiffs’ Liaison Counsel.*** Chirali Patel of Carella Byrne Cecchi Brody & Agnello, P.C. shall serve as Plaintiffs’ Liaison Counsel.

3. ***Plaintiffs’ Committees.*** Further, this Court hereby appoints a Plaintiffs’ Executive Committee and a Plaintiffs Steering Committee (“PEC” and “PSC” respectively) which shall consist of the following attorneys and their respective law firms, in addition to Lead and Liaison counsel set forth above:

**Plaintiffs Executive Committee (“PEC”) Members:**

**Timothy M. O’Brien (Chair of Discovery)**

Levin Papantonio Rafferty Proctor Buchanan O’Brien Barr Mougey, P.A.  
316 South Baylen St.  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Phone: (850) 435-7084  
Fax: (850) 435-6084  
Email: [tobrien@levinlaw.com](mailto:tobrien@levinlaw.com)

**W. Mark Lanier (Chair of Trial Preparation and Trial)**

Lanier Law Firm, P.C.  
6810 Cypress Creek Parkway  
Houston TX 77064  
Phone: (713) 659-5200  
Fax: (713) 659-2204  
Email: [WML@lanierlawfirm.com](mailto:WML@lanierlawfirm.com)

**Paola Pearson**

Anapol Weiss  
One Logan Square  
130 N. 18<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 1600  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Phone: (215) 790-4554  
Fax: (215) 875-7719  
Email: [ppearson@anapolweiss.com](mailto:ppearson@anapolweiss.com)

**Melanie H. Muhlstock**

Parker Waichman, LLP  
6 Harbor Park Drive  
Port Washington, NY 11050  
Phone: (516) 466-6500  
Fax: (516) 723-4729  
Email: [mmuhlstock@yourlawyer.com](mailto:mmuhlstock@yourlawyer.com)

**D. Nicole Guntner**

Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis & Overholtz, PLLC  
17 East Main Street, Suite 200  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Phone: (850) 202-1010  
Fax: (850) 916-7449  
Email: [NGuntner@awkolaw.com](mailto:NGuntner@awkolaw.com)

**Danielle Gold**

Weitz & Luxenberg, P.C.  
700 Broadway  
New York, NY 10003  
Phone: (212) 558-5500  
Fax: (212) 344-5461  
Email: [dgold@weitzlux.com](mailto:dgold@weitzlux.com)

**Rachel L. Shkolnik**

Napoli Shkolnik, PLLC  
360 Lexington Avenue, 11th Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
Phone: (212) 397-1000 Ext. 1050  
Fax: (888) 870-2757  
Email: [rachels@napolilaw.com](mailto:rachels@napolilaw.com)

**Plaintiffs Steering Committee (“PSC”) Members:**

**Aimee Wagstaff**

Andrus & Wagstaff, P.C.  
7171 West Alaska Drive  
Lakewood, CO 80226  
Phone: (720) 208-9414  
Fax: (303) 376-6361  
Email: [aimee.wagstaff@andruswagstaff.com](mailto:aimee.wagstaff@andruswagstaff.com)

**Emily Acosta**

Levy Konisgberg, LLP  
800 Third Avenue, 11th Floor  
New York, NY 10022  
Phone: (212) 605-6200  
Fax: (212) 605-6253  
Email: [EAcosta@levylaw.com](mailto:EAcosta@levylaw.com)

**Francisco R. Maderal**

Colson Hicks Edison  
255 Alhambra Circle Penthouse  
Coral Gables, FL 33134  
Phone: (305) 476-7400  
Fax: (305) 476-7444  
Email: [frank@colson.com](mailto:frank@colson.com)

**Danielle Mason**

Sanders Phillips Grossman, LLC  
100 Garden City Plaza, Suite 500  
Garden City, NY 11530  
Phone: (888) 910-0844  
Fax: (516) 741-0128  
Email: [dmason@thesandersfirm.com](mailto:dmason@thesandersfirm.com)

**Sindhu Daniel**

Grant & Eisenhofer, P.A.  
123 Justison Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Phone: (302) 622-7033  
Fax: (302) 622-7100  
Email: [sdaniel@gelaw.com](mailto:sdaniel@gelaw.com)

**Anne Callis**

Holland Law Firm  
211 N Broadway Suite 2625  
St. Louis, MO 63102  
Phone: (618) 452-1323  
Fax: (618) 452-8024  
Email: [acallis@hollandtriallawyers.com](mailto:acallis@hollandtriallawyers.com)

**Robert J. Drakulich**

The Drakulich Firm, APLC  
2727 Camino del Rio South, Suite 322  
San Diego, California 92108  
Phone: (858) 755-5887  
Fax: (858) 755-6456  
Email: [rjd@draklaw.com](mailto:rjd@draklaw.com)

**Catherine Hilliard**

Hilliard Martinez Gonzales, LLP  
719 S Shoreline Blvd,  
Corpus Christi, TX 78401  
Phone: (361) 882-1612  
Fax: (361) 882-3015  
Email: [catherine@hmglawfirm.com](mailto:catherine@hmglawfirm.com)

**Megan Moore**

Pulaski Kherkher, PLLC  
2925 Richmond Avenue Suite 1725  
Houston, TX 77098  
Phone: (832) 690-4024  
Fax: (713) 664-7543  
Email: [megan@pulaskilawfirm.com](mailto:megan@pulaskilawfirm.com)

**Scott Morgan**

Schlichter Board & Denton, LLP  
100 South Fourth Street, Suite 1200  
Saint Louis, MO 63102  
Phone: (314) 621-6115  
Fax: (314) 621-7151  
Email: [smorgan@uselaws.com](mailto:smorgan@uselaws.com)

**Ruth Rizkalla**

The Carlson Law Firm  
200 Pier Avenue, Suite 126  
Hermosa Beach, CA 90254  
Phone: (866) 515-7369  
Fax: (254) 526-2325  
Email: [RRizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com](mailto:RRizkalla@carlsonattorneys.com)

**Thomas P. Valet**

Rappaport, Glass, Levine, & Zullo, LLP  
1355 Motor Parkway  
Islandia, NY 11749  
Phone: (631) 293-2300  
Fax: (631) 293-2918  
Email: [tvalet@rapplaw.com](mailto:tvalet@rapplaw.com)

**Melanie S. Bailey**

Burg Simpson Eldredge Hersh & Jardine, P.C.  
201 East 5th Street, Suite 1340  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
Phone: (513) 852-5600  
Fax: (513) 852-5611  
Email: [m Bailey@burgsimpson.com](mailto:m Bailey@burgsimpson.com)

**Nina Towle Herring**

Cory Watson Attorneys  
2131 Magnolia Ave S  
Birmingham, AL 35205  
Phone: (205) 271-7151  
Fax: (205) 324-7896  
Email: [nherring@corywatson.com](mailto:nherring@corywatson.com)

4. The appointment to the PSC is of a personal nature. Accordingly, the above appointees cannot be substituted by other attorneys, including members of the appointee's law firm, to perform the PSC's exclusive functions, such as committee meetings and court appearances, except with prior Court approval.

5. In addition to their duties as PEC and PSC members, the Court appoints Paola Pearson as Federal-State liaison to the state court litigants in the State of Pennsylvania and Emily Acosta as Federal-State liaison to state court litigants in the State of New Jersey. The Court will hereafter expand upon the expectations it has for these roles.

**Duties of Co-Lead Counsel**

6. In CMO #1, the Court identified certain responsibilities of the PSC, and these duties are incorporated and adopted herein by reference. To ensure that these duties are carried out, it shall be Co-Lead Counsel's duty to coordinate the responsibilities of both the PEC and PSC, in accordance with the responsibilities identified by the Court in CMO #1 as well as other responsibilities that may exist, schedule PEC and PSC meetings, keep minutes of these meetings, appear at periodic court noticed status conferences, and to perform other necessary substantive, administrative or logistic functions to ensure the functions of the PEC and PSC are conducted in an efficient and professional manner. Co-Lead counsel duties include conducting the litigation and coordinating the efforts of the PEC and PSC in conducting the litigation, including, but not limited to, the following:

**Discovery**

- a. Initiate, coordinate, and conduct all pretrial discovery on behalf of all Plaintiffs who file actions in this Court or that are transferred to this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407 related to Elmiron.
- b. Develop and propose to the Court schedules for the commencement, execution, and completion of all discovery on behalf of all Plaintiffs.
- c. Initiate, coordinate, and cause to be issued in the name of all Plaintiffs the necessary discovery requests, motions, and subpoenas pertaining to any witness and documents needed to properly prepare for the pretrial of relevant issues found in the pleadings of this litigation.
- d. Conduct all discovery in a coordinated, efficient, and consolidated manner on behalf and for the benefit of all plaintiffs.

**Conduct Motion Practice, Hearings and Meetings**

- e. Submit any motions presented to the Court on behalf of all Plaintiffs as well as oppose when necessary any motions submitted by the Defendant or third parties.
- f. Call meetings of counsel for plaintiffs for any appropriate purpose, including coordinating responses to questions of other parties or of the Court. Initiate proposals, suggestions, schedules, or joint briefs, and any other appropriate matter(s) pertaining to pretrial proceedings.
- g. Examine or designate other counsel to examine witnesses and introduce evidence at hearings on behalf of Plaintiffs.

**Contact with Defense Counsel**

- h. Initiate, coordinate and conduct the requisite meet and confers with Defendants, confer with Defendants regarding procedural matters, and negotiate and enter into stipulations with Defendants regarding this litigation.
- i. Explore or designate other counsel to explore, develop, and pursue settlement options with Defendants on behalf of Plaintiffs.

**Oversight of the PEC and PSC**

- j. Call meetings of counsel for Plaintiffs for any appropriate purpose.
- k. Monitor the activities of the PEC, the PSC and other co-counsel to ensure that schedules are met and unnecessary expenditures of time and funds are avoided.

7. *Plaintiffs' Liaison Counsel.* The responsibilities of Plaintiffs' Liaison Counsel, certain of which were identified in CMO #1, shall be the following:



- a. To serve as the recipient for all Court Orders;
- b. To coordinate services and filings;
- c. To maintain and distribute to co-counsel and to Defendant's Counsel an up-to-date service list;
- d. To make herself available for any telephone conferences convened by the Court and to communicate the substance of any such conference to all other Plaintiffs' counsel;
- e. To receive and distribute pleadings, Orders, and motions;
- f. To maintain and make available to all Plaintiffs' counsel of record at reasonable hours a complete file of all documents served by or upon each party (except such documents as may be available at a document depository);
- g. To make themselves available for any telephone conferences convened by the Court and to communicate the substance of any such telephone conference to all other Plaintiffs' counsel;
- h. To carry out any and all duties identified by the Court in Case Management Order #1; and
- i. To carry out such other duties as the Court may Order.

8. All communications from Plaintiffs with the Court should be through Co-Lead Counsel or Liaison Counsel. If circumstances require direct correspondence with the Court by an individual counsel, copies of any said communications shall simultaneously be served upon Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel and Liaison Counsel.

9. Nothing herein shall be construed to preclude the Lead Counsel together with the PEC from agreeing to permit attorneys not appointed to the PEC and PSC from assisting with the conduct of this litigation.

10. Under no circumstances are Co-Lead counsel, the PEC, or any member of the PSC responsible for the filings, discovery, or any other issue or matter related to an individual plaintiff's case or claim. More specifically, the PSC is in no way responsible for the attorney-client relationship and the duties and responsibilities each individual attorney or law firm owe to their clients in prosecution of their individual case.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: January 22, 2021

*/s/Brian R. Martinotti*  
**HON. BRIAN R. MARTINOTTI**  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE**